

INTRODUCTION

The Commonwealth has spent or committed \$146 million to subsidize market rate housing under the <u>Housing Development Incentive Program (HDIP)</u> and is poised to spend up to another \$30 million every year indefinitely.² Yet the key question about HDIP remains unanswered: <u>why is the state spending precious resources on high-end housing?</u>

One such "precious resource" is the Mass. Rental Voucher Program (MRVP) which provides housing vouchers to help lower income families and individuals pay rent in the private market. In January, while thousands of households remain on the MRVP waiting list hoping for a chance to find homes they can afford and avoid homelessness, EOHLC "paused" issuance of MRVP vouchers for an unknown period of time "in response to a difficult state fiscal situation." And yet, just one month before MRVP was frozen, the Healey administration announced an additional \$27 million in HDIP credit awards for market rate developers. Something is very wrong when the state holds back new housing vouchers while at the same time *increases* the flow of resources to subsidize developers of high-rent housing.

MLRI's 2022 HDIP report documented some disturbing features of this program: HDIP awards support projects with almost no affordable units; HDIP housing is targeted to small households with disposable income; rents are generally well above market and often shockingly high; credits are not distributed evenly or equitably among Gateway Cities; most HDIP units have only a small number of bedrooms and are not suitable for families with children, and HDIP provides no direct benefits to lower income families in Gateway Cities.

This update to the MLRI report provides troubling new data and continued concerns about this costly program that supports only higher priced housing.

I. What is HDIP?

The Housing Development Incentive Program (HDIP) is the state's (and perhaps the country's) only subsidy program exclusively for market rate housing developments. Enacted in 2010 in G.L. Chapter 40V, HDIP offers millions in state tax credits and local tax exemptions to developers in Gateway Cities in which at least 80% of the units are market rate. HDIP is administered by the Executive Office of Housing and Economic Development (EOHLC). The statute allows credit awards of up to 25% of qualified development costs, subject to any per-project maximum EOHLC may impose. While HDIP credits can be used in mixed income projects (up to 20% affordable), the credit is calculated only on costs attributed to the market rate units and only three percent of the total 5,370 completed or planned units awarded credits are affordable.

II. HDIP Update at a Glance

Total HDIP awards as of Jan. 2025 ³	Recent HDIP awards reviewed in this report ⁴
o \$146 million in HDIP credits	 \$86 million in HDIP credits:
o 88 projects	o 48 projects
o 5,370 units	o 2,709 units
o 20 cities	o 16 cities
o 97% market rate	o 96.2% market rate
o 3% affordable.	o 3.8% affordable
o 5,281 rental units	o 2680 rental units
o 89 condominium units	o 29 condominium units

HDIP credit awards have grown dramatically since 2023 when the Legislature more than tripled the \$10 million annual cap on credit awards to \$57 million in calendar year 2023 and \$30 million annually thereafter. This expansion occurred despite little public information on the program and a December 2022 MLRI HDIP report revealing troubling aspects of this subsidy for higher priced housing that ignores the urgent need for affordable housing for Gateway Cities residents.

The lack of official information on HDIP was addressed by the Legislature in 2020 when it amended Chapter 40V to require EOHLC to submit annual reports with detailed information on each HDIP project it had evaluated in the prior fiscal year ("Chapter 40V reports"). Four years passed without EOHLC

submitting any of the required reports. Finally, in response to a request from Senator Jamie Eldridge in October 2024. EOHLC filed its first Chapter 40V report (covering FY2024) and in early December submitted the FY2021-23 reports. The four reports cover 36 projects that had received final or conditional awards⁶ during those four fiscal years – most not yet completed. The Chapter 40V reports are on the Legislature's website at https://malegislature.gov/Reports.

III. HDIP reports to the Legislature for FY 2021-2024 reveal the same troubling issues documented in the 2022 MLRI HDIP report.⁷

The FY 21-24 Chapter 40V reports provide a partial picture of HDIP that confirms the concerns raised by the MLRI HDIP report.

The state continues to spend millions on HDIP market rate housing. The Chapter 40V reports show that in FY 21-24 the state awarded over \$59 million in HDIP credits on top of the total \$59 million already spent to subsidize HDIP market rate housing and then awarded another \$27 million in December 2024. Of the 88 projects approved to date, 53 had been completed (received final certification) as of July 2024. See Appendix 1.

• The FY 21-24 credit awards continue to subsidize HDIP projects that have almost no affordable units. While projects can be mixed income—up to 20% affordable—and the market rate units can qualify for credits, only six of the 36 projects in these reports have affordable units (23 of 2000 units or 1%). See below Table.

Annual HDIP Conditional Credit Awards by Fiscal Year

Conditional Certification Fiscal Year	# projects	Project Has final credit	Total Units	Market Rate Units	Afford- able Units	% afford- able	Total Credit Awarded or Reserved
2013	2	2	60	55	5	8.3%	1,167,825
2014	3	3	123	123	-	-	2,232,077
2015	1	1	18	18	-	-	474,434
2016	4	4	290	282	8	2.8%	6,428,173
2017	8	8	896	868	28	3.1%	10,898,644
2018	4	4	319	319	-	-	8,000,000
2019	8	8	420	414	6	1.4%	14,372,860
2020	9	9	501	487	14	2.8%	14,360,717
2020.1	1	1	34	34	-	-	1,500,000
Subtotal FY2013-2020	40	40	2,661	2,600	61	2.3%	59,434,730
2021	10	9	232	232	-	-	11,040,618
2022	11	4	1,170	1,160	10	0.9%	19,725,000
2023	1	-	54	54	-	-	1,800,000
2024	14	-	544	531	13	2.4%	26,919,686
Subtotal FY2021-2024	36	13	2,000	1,977	23	1.2%	59,485,304
FY2025 thru Dec	12	-	709	628	81	11.4%	26,979,081
Subtotal FY2021-Present	48	13	2,709	2,605	104		86,464,385
Grand Total	88	53	5,370	5,205	165	3.1%	145,899,115

• The FY 21-24 credit awards continue to subsidize HDIP projects with rents that are out of reach for most Gateway City renters. The "range of rents" for the 36 HDIP projects listed in the statutory reports in most cases reflect an early estimate by the developer of what might be charged initially and were made when conditional credits were approved (prior to starting construction). 9 In some cases, rents at completion are much steeper than the developer's estimate in its initial HDIP conditional credit application ¹⁰ and there is no limit on future rent increases. Even though most of the reported rents are early estimates, many are higher—some much higher—than going area rents, generally not affordable to local renters, and priced above what rental voucher holders can pay. Among the 36 projects in the EOHLC reports, almost all the rents are over \$2,000. These include projected top rents of \$3,386 in Fall River; \$2,900 in Lowell; \$2,841 in Worcester and \$2,650 in Brockton. The HDIP market rate condos in Salem have anticipated prices of \$499,000 to \$710,000 (the one affordable condo is \$220,000).

• The FY 21-24 awards continue to subsidize units that mostly have a small number of bedrooms. Seventy percent of the units in the 36 HDIP projects (1,393 of the 2,000 total projected units) covered by these four reports are studios or one-bedroom units. Very few are suitable for families with children (2.2% of units are three-bedroom).

	A	Annual H	DIP Cond	ditiona	Credit /	Awards b	y Fiscal	Year -	Bedr	oom N	lix			
Conditional Certification Fiscal Year	# projects	Total Units	Shared suites	0 BR	1 BR	0 or 1BR**	2BR	3BR	4BR	Don't know BR size	,	% 2BR	% 3+ BR	% Don't know
Total 2013-2020	40	2,661	185	175	1,458	2	819	21	1	-	68.4%	30.8%	0.8%	-
2021	10	232	-	84	85	-	63	-	-	-	72.8%	27.2%	-	-
2022	11	1,170	-	136	732	-	272	30	-	-	74.2%	23.2%	2.6%	-
2023	1	54	-	-	34	-	20	-	-	-	63.0%	37.0%	-	-
2024	14	544	-	130	192	-	208	14	-	-	59.2%	38.2%	2.6%	-
Total 2021-2024	36	2,000	-	350	1,043	-	563	44	-	-	69.7%	28.2%	2.2%	-
2025 thru Dec	12	709	-	70	280	81	237	26	-	15	60.8%	33.4%	3.7%	2.1%
Total 2021-Present	48	2,709	-	420	1,323	81	800	70	-	15	67.3%	29.5%	2.6%	0.6%
Grand Total	88	5,370	185	595	2,781	83	1,619	91	1	15	67.9%	30.1%	1.7%	0.3%

- The FY 21-24 awards continue to be concentrated in a handful of cities. As noted in the MLRI report and summarized in Appendix 2, HDIP units and credits are largely concentrated in a few Gateway cities. The 36 projects in the Chapter 40V reports are in 14 cities, but four cities account for 77% of the HDIP market rate units and 55% of the credit awards. Worcester, which has already received the lion's share of HDIP credits and units is awarded final or conditional tax credits for 1,115 units 56% of the market rate units in the FY 2021-2024 reports. Brockton projects total 182 market rate units (9%), Fall River 131 units (6.6%) and Lowell 100 units (5%).
- IV. New HDIP awards announced in December 2024 will yield similar inequitable results as those described in the MLRI 2022 report.

The Chapter 40V legislative reports cover 36 projects which received conditional credit awards in the past four fiscal years. On December 17, 2024 EOHLC announced conditional awards for 12 more developments with 709 units in 9 Gateway municipalities. 131 of these are affordable. This is the largest funding year in program history.

Nine of the 12 projects received \$2.5 million in credits despite a huge variation in size ranging from 18 to 250 units. With these new awards the state continues to support projects for relatively upper income households

while the *real* affordable housing crisis wreaks havoc on the lives of low income people.

Rents in most of these 12 projects are expected to be as high as those in previous HDIP rounds. Six of the 12 projects have affordable units (81 of 709—11%). There are more affordable units overall among these 12 projects, because the one large development (250 units in Salem) will be 20% affordable. But this increase barely affects the entire program where only 3% of 5,370 units are affordable.

These projects remain concentrated in a limited number of communities, though the 12 awards announced on 12/17/2024 provide greater locational diversity. These projects include first-time awards for New Bedford (2 projects) and Taunton (one project) and one award to Worcester. Combined with the awards in the four Chapter 40V reports, 4 of the 16 cities account for 65% of the 2,605 market rate units and 42% of the credit awards: Worcester (43.5%), Salem (9%), Brockton (7%) and Lawrence (6%). *See* Appendix 3.

Taken together, the conditional and final awards since the start of FY 2021 come to over \$86 million for 2,709 units - 3.8% affordable.

Total HDIP credit awards to date (conditional or final) cost or will cost the state \$146 million to subsidize 88 projects in 20 municipalities. These projects include 5,370 HDIP units, of which 5,205 (97%), are market rate and 3% affordable. 53 of these projects had been completed as of August 2024. *See* Appendix 1.

CONCLUSION

As Massachusetts faces a "difficult fiscal situation" and the threat of funding cuts from Washington, ¹¹we cannot afford costly annual subsidies for housing that ignores the needs of lower-income Gateway Cities residents. All developers supported by HDIP receive local tax breaks, and some projects also benefit from substantial public investments in transit and infrastructure as well as other state development subsidies, including historic tax credits. These public resources support housing that effectively excludes families and individuals with modest incomes who are experiencing the greatest need.

We urge legislators and state officials to review this report, take a second look at HDIP, and then implement reforms such as those recommended in the 2022 MLRI HDIP report. First among those reforms would be to revise HDIP to support both market rate and affordable housing for lower income households: a "housing development incentive program" for ALL Gateway City residents!

Appendix 1: HDIP Projects with Credit Awards to Date

Cond Cert		# Pro-	Has		Total	Market Rate	Afford- able	% Afford-	Total Credit Awarded or	Average credit/	Total Qualified Expenditures	QPE*/	Credit as
Yr (FY)				Project	Units	Units	Units			market unit	(QPE)	unit	
	Attleboro	1		The Jewel	43	43	-	-	1,800,000	41,860	7,673,000	178,442	23.59
	Attleboro	1		Briggs Crossing	46	46		-	1,800,000	39,130	10,400,000	226,087	17.39
2022	Attleboro Total	2			89	89	_	-	3,600,000	33,130	10,400,000	220,007	17.57
2020	Barnstable	1		JP Baxter Residences	8	8		-	386,926	48,366	_		
	Barnstable	1		Captain Bearse House	9	9		-	475,000	52,778	2,544,537	282,726	18.79
	Barnstable	1		Residence at 850	53	43	10	23.3%	1,800,000	41,860	15,483,000	360,070	11.69
		1			12	10	2	20.0%		-			20.99
	Barnstable	1		Linnell Landing	45	36	9	25.0%	690,000	69,000	3,300,000	330,000	20.97
2025	Barnstable	5		Flats on Barnstable Rd	127			16.5%	2,500,000	69,444	-	-	
2017	Barnstable Total	1			24	106	21	16.5%	5,851,926	27.100	2 572 225	140.042	25.00
	Brockton Brockton			47 Pleasant St 47 West Elm	44	24 44			892,045	37,169	3,572,225	148,843	25.09
		1					-	-	2,000,000	45,455	F 047 406	207.250	24.40
	Brockton	1		Main St 19-31 (One Nine)	20	20	-	-	1,452,000	72,600	5,947,186	297,359	24.49
	Brockton	1		Centre St 127	40	40	-	-	2,000,000	50,000	10,700,000	267,500	18.79
	Brockton	1		28 Petronelli Way	18	18	-	-	2,500,000	138,889	8,727,000	484,833	28.69
	Brockton	1		46 Montello	54	54	-	-	1,800,000	33,333	18,850,000	349,074	9.59
2024	Brockton	1		Ringside Residences	50	50	-	-	2,500,000	50,000	20,497,000	409,940	12.29
	Brockton Total	7			250	250	-	-	13,144,045				
2013	Chelsea	1		Flats at 44	46	41	5		832,021		9,294,557	226,697	9.09
	Chelsea Total	1	. 1		46	41	5	12.2%	832,021				
2016	Fall River	1	. 1	Commonwealth Landing	103	103	-	-	1,935,305	18,789	19,538,957	189,699	9.99
*2020	Fall River	1	. 1	30 Third Street	18	18	-	-	825,265	45,848		-	
2020	Fall River	1	1	The Creative Class	55	44	11	25.0%	2,000,000	45,455		-	
**2021	Fall River	1	1	Adams House	34	34	-	-	1,500,000	44,118	-	-	
2022	Fall River	1	1	Residences at Rivers Edge	49	49	-	-	1,500,000	30,612	14,073,000	287,204	10.79
2024	Fall River	1	C	Merrill Bldg aka Union Belt Co Lofts	36	36	-	-	2,500,000	69,444	10,240,000	284,444	24.49
2024	Fall River	1		Sacred Heart Church 160 Linden	46	46	-	-	2,500,000	54,348	10,812,000	235,043	23.1%
	Fall River Total	7	5		341	330	11	3.3%	12,760,570				
2021	Fitchburg	1	. 1	18 Blossom St	7	7	-	-	375,000	53,571	1,602,738	228,963	23.4%
	Fitchburg	1	0	Main St 347-355	8	8		-	479,081	59.885	-	-	
	Fitchburg	1		Iver Mills	96	96		-	2,500,000	26,042	-	-	
	Fitchburg Total	3			111	111		-	3,354,081				
2015	Haverhill	1		JM Lofts (37 Washington)	18	18		-	474,434	26,357	4,884,672	271,371	9.7%
	Haverhill	1		Harbor Place at Riverfront	30	24	6	25.0%	362,868	15,120	3,628,680	151,195	10.0%
	Haverhill	1		24 Essex Street	59	59	-	-	2,000,000	33,898	11,562,324	195,972	17.3%
	Haverhill	1		87 Washington St	24	24	-	-	1,819,110	75,796	7,279,240	303,302	25.0%
	Haverhill	1		The Heights	42	42	-	-	2,000,000	47,619	7,273,240	303,302	25.07
	Haverhill	1		Prescott	14	14	-	-	833,495	59,535		_	
	Haverhill	1		Webster Building	9	9	-		600,000	66,667	2,434,384	270,487	24.69
	Haverhill	1		St. Josephs School	36	36			1,800,000	50,000	7,023,000	195,083	25.69
	Haverhill	1		Franklin Block	21	21	-			-			21.89
	Haverhill	1			42	33	9	27.3%	1,300,000	61,905	5,973,000	284,429	21.87
2025				Essex St Lofts					2,500,000	75,758	-	-	
	Haverhill Total	10			295	280	15	5.4%	13,689,907				40.00
	Holyoke	1		181 Appleton/Cubit	18	18	-	-	381,049	21,169	3,819,890	212,216	10.09
	Holyoke	1		Hotel Jess	8	8	-		475,000	59,375	2,842,000	355,250	16.79
	Holyoke	1		Wrights Block	19	16	3	18.8%	2,000,000	125,000	7,247,000	452,938	27.69
2025	Holyoke	1		Open Square Mill 2	84	84	-	-	2,500,000	29,762	-	-	
	Holyoke Total	4			129	126	3	2.4%	5,356,049				
	Lawrence	1		"Lupoli" (Riverwalk)	272	272	-	-	3,800,000	13,971		-	
	Lawrence	1		Riverwalk West	66	66	-	-	2,000,000	30,303	23,249,759	352,269	8.69
	Lawrence	1		The Jav	24	24	-	-	2,200,000	91,667	8,800,000	366,667	25.09
2025	Lawrence	1			60	60	-	-	2,500,000	41,667	-	-	
	Lawrence Total	4	. 2		422	422	-	-	10,500,000				
2014	Leominster	1	1	Lofts at City Place	51	51	-	-	559,206		6,363,246	124,770	8.89
2019	Leominster	1	1	45 Summer Street	36	36	-	-	1,740,000	48,333		-	
2021	Leominster	1	1	41 Summer Street	21	21	-	-	693,618	33,029	2,896,659	137,936	23.9%
			3		108	108			2,992,824				

Appendix 1: HDIP Projects with Credit Awards to Date (continued)

Cond Cert		Has # Pro- final		Total	Market Rate	able		Total Credit Awarded or	credit/	Total Qualified Expenditures		Credit a
Yr (FY)	City	jects credi	Project	Units	Units	Units	able	Reserved	market unit	(QPE)	unit	% QF
2014	Lowell		1 24 Merrimack Street	47	47	-	-	900,000		11,159,033	237,426	8.19
2016	Lowell	1	1 Adden Redevelopment	75	73	2	2.7%	2,130,000	29,178	21,457,901	293,944	9.9
2018	Lowell	1	1 Thorndike Exchange	65	65	-	-	2,000,000	30,769	20,306,991	312,415	9.89
2018	Lowell	1	1 Edge Merrimack River	147	147	-	-	2,000,000	13,605	40,390,089	274,763	5.09
2019	Lowell	1	1 Waterhead	71	71	-	-	2,000,000	28,169		-	
2021	Lowell	1	1 160 Middlesex St	24	24	-	-	1,000,000	41,667	4,887,974	203,666	20.59
2024	Lowell	1	0 Isobel Lofts	26	26	-	-	2,000,000	76,923	9,400,000	361,538	21.39
2024	Lowell	1	0 Hildreth Building (aka 45 Merrimack)	50	50	-	-	2,500,000	50,000	16,366,000	327,320	15.39
	Lowell Total	8	6	505	503	2	0.4%	14,530,000				
2017	Lynn	1	1 23 Central Avenue (Vault)	49	49	-	-	1,400,000	28,571	10,177,190	207,698	13.89
	Lynn Total		1	49	49	-	-	1,400,000			,	
2017	Malden		1 Masonic Block (Residences at Malden Station)	69	69	-	-	2,000,000	28,986	22,411,910	324,810	8.9
	Malden		1 Jefferson at Malden Center	320	320	-	-	3,000,000	9,375	, ,-	- /	
	Malden Total		2	389	389	_	-	5,000,000	0,0.0			
2025	New Bedford		0 Elmwater Landing	18	18	_	_	2,500,000	138,889	_		
	New Bedford		0 193-197 Union St	45	36	9	25.0%	2,500,000	69,444	_	_	
2023	New Bedford Total		0	63	54	9	16.7%	5,000,000	03,444			
2012	Pittsfield		1 Howard Building	14	14	-				3,743,524	267,395	9.09
			-				-	335,804				
	Pittsfield		1 Onota Building	25	25			772,871	26.075	7,728,712	309,148	10.0
	Pittsfield		1 Power House Lofts	10	10	-	-	368,750	36,875	2,058,399	205,840	17.99
	Pittsfield		1 Morningstar	29	29	-	-	1,813,750	62,543		-	
	Pittsfield		1 Tyler St 765	16	16	-	-	974,766	60,923	4,238,113	264,882	23.0
2021	Pittsfield		1 Tyler St 730-748	20	20	-	-	1,470,234	73,512	6,065,489	303,274	24.29
2024	Pittsfield	1	0 Wright Building Block-NC	14	11	3	27.3%	1,518,014	138,001	6,500,000	590,909	23.49
2024	Pittsfield	1	0 Wright Building Block-Historic	21	17	4	23.5%	2,581,672	151,863	11,039,000	649,353	23.49
	Pittsfield Total	8	6	149	142	7	4.9%	9,835,861				
2017	Quincy	1	1 The Watson	140	112	28	25.0%	2,000,000	17,857	32,603,102	291,099	6.19
	Quincy Total	1	1	140	112	28	25.0%	2,000,000				
2019	Salem	1	1 Brix Condominiums	60	54	6	11.1%	2,000,000	37,037		-	
2020	Salem	1	1 Harbor Point Apartments	37	34	3	8.8%	1,994,467	58,661		-	
2024	Salem	1	0 Broad St 5	16	15	1	6.7%	1,500,000	100,000	9,850,000	656,667	15.29
2025	Salem	1	0 Bay View aka Riverwalk Phase II	13	11	2	18.2%	2,000,000	181,818	-	-	
2025	Salem	1	0 Residences on Canal St	250	200	50	25.0%	2,500,000	12,500	-	-	
	Salem Total	5	2	376	314	62	19.7%	9,994,467				
2017	Springfield		1 Silver Brick Lofts (rehab)	266	266	-	_	856,800	3,221	8,568,000	32,211	10.09
	Springfield		1 SilverBrick Square (122 Chestnut) (rehab)	114	114	_	-	1,000,000	8,772	7,462,023	65,456	13.49
	Springfield		1 151 Chestnut St (Overland Lofts)	60	60	-	-	2,000,000	33,333	7,102,023	-	20.1.
	Springfield		0 Parsons Apartments	11	11		-	630,000	57,273	4,123,000	374,818	15.3
2024	Springfield Total		3	451	451		_	4,486,800	37,273	4,123,000	374,010	13.3
2025	Taunton		0 Porter St 12	28	28	-		2,000,000	71,429	-	-	
2025	Taunton Total			28	28	-	-		71,429	-	-	
2046			0			-	-	2,000,000	24 200	27 722 574	220.000	7.00
	Worcester		1 Edge at Union Station	82	82	-	-	2,000,000	24,390	27,722,574	338,080	7.2
	Worcester		1 Harding Green (Kelley Sq Lofts)	48	48	-	-	2,000,000	41,667	15,349,900	319,790	13.0
	Worcester		1 Elmwood Apartments	13	13	-	-	770,564	59,274		-	
	Worcester		1 6 Chatham Street	24	24	-	-	1,750,000	72,917		-	
2022	Worcester		1 Mission Chapel	7	7	-	-	1,000,000	142,857	4,020,000	574,286	24.9
2022	Worcester		0 115 Madison (The Revington)	228	228	-	-	2,250,000	9,868	93,784,000	411,333	2.4
2022	Worcester	1	0 Silverbrick Skyhouse	312	312	-	-	3,800,000	12,179	60,000,000	192,308	6.3
2022	Worcester	1	0 Alta Seven Hills	370	370	-	-	1,000,000	2,703	100,000,000	270,270	1.0
2024	Worcester	1	O Chestnut Place (Fallon HQ)	198	198	-	-	2,500,000	12,626	73,448,000	370,949	3.4
	Worcester	1	0 Main St 204 (Kane Bldg aka Olympic Trophy Bldg)	20	18	2	11.1%	2,500,000	138,889	-	-	
2025												
2025	Worcester Total		5	1302	1300	2	0.2%	19,570,564				

Notes

Data sources: FY2021-2024 EOHLC reports to Legislature; EOHLC public records request July 2024 (for earlier projects); 12/17/2024 EOHLC press release on FY2025 conditional awards, supplemented by information on municipal websites.

^{*}Chapter 40V allows the award of an HDIP credit of "not more than 25 per cent of the cost of qualified project expenditures [QPE] allocable to the market rate units in a project" (defined as "an expenditure directly related to the construction or substantial rehabilitation of a certified housing development project.") The statute also allows EOHLC to impose a per-project maximum award so that larger projects tend to receive credits well below 25% of project costs while smaller projects receive close to 25%. For example, the \$2.5 million credit award to Chestnut Place in Worcester (198 units) is 3.4% of the estimated QPE, while Mission Place (7 units) received a credit equal to 24.9% of QPE.

^{***}Not in FY2021 EOHLC report -

Appendix 2: Municipal Share of Projects Receiving Conditional Awards in FY2021-FY2024

							Share of	
			Market	Afford-	Ttl	Share of	Market	Share of
	#	Total	Rate	able	conditional or	Total	Rate	Credit
City	Projects	Units	Units	Units	final credit	Units	Units	Awards
Worcester	5	1,115	1,115	-	10,550,000	55.8%	56.4%	17.7%
Brockton	5	182	182	-	10,252,000	9.1%	9.2%	17.2%
Fall River	3	131	131	-	6,500,000	6.6%	6.6%	10.9%
Lowell	3	100	100	-	5,500,000	5.0%	5.1%	9.2%
Subtotal	16	1,528	1,528	-	32,802,000	76.4%	77.3%	55.1%
Lawrence	2	90	90	-	4,200,000	4.5%	4.6%	7.1%
Attleboro	2	89	89	-	3,600,000	4.5%	4.5%	6.1%
Haverhill	3	66	66	-	3,700,000	3.3%	3.3%	6.2%
Pittsfield	4	71	64	7	6,544,686	3.6%	3.2%	11.0%
Barnstable	3	74	62	12	2,965,000	3.7%	3.1%	5.0%
Holyoke	2	27	24	3	2,475,000	1.4%	1.2%	4.2%
Leominster	1	21	21	-	693,618	1.1%	1.1%	1.2%
Salem	1	16	15	1	1,500,000	0.8%	0.8%	2.5%
Springfield	1	11	11	-	630,000	0.6%	0.6%	1.1%
Fitchburg	1	7	7	-	375,000	0.4%	0.4%	0.6%
Grand Total	36	2,000	1,977	23	59,485,304	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%

Appendix 3: Municipal Share of Projects receiving Conditional Awards - FY2021-FY2024 and December 2024

						Avg credit				
			Market	Afford-	Conditional or	per			Share	Share of
	# of	Total	rate	able	Final Credit	market	Avg credit	Share of	of Mkt	Credits
Muni	Projects	units	units	Units	Awards	rate u	per project	Total U	Rate U	awarded
Worcester	6	1,135	1,133	2	13,050,000	11,518	2,175,000	41.9%	43.5%	15.1%
Salem	3	279	226	53	6,000,000	26,549	2,000,000	10.3%	8.7%	6.9%
Brockton	5	182	182	-	10,252,000	56,330	2,050,400	6.7%	7.0%	11.9%
Lawrence	3	150	150	-	6,700,000	44,667	2,233,333	5.5%	5.8%	7.7%
Subtotal	17	1,746	1,691	55	36,002,000	139,063	8,458,733	64.5%	64.9%	41.6%
Fall River	3	131	131	-	6,500,000	49,618	2,166,667	4.8%	5.0%	7.5%
Barnstable	4	119	98	21	5,465,000	55,765	1,366,250	4.4%	3.8%	6.3%
Fitchburg	3	111	111	-	3,354,081	30,217	1,118,027	4.1%	4.3%	3.9%
Holyoke	3	111	108	3	4,975,000	46,065	1,658,333	4.1%	4.1%	5.8%
Haverhill	4	108	99	9	6,200,000	62,626	1,550,000	4.0%	3.8%	7.2%
Lowell	3	100	100	-	5,500,000	55,000	1,833,333	3.7%	3.8%	6.4%
Attleboro	2	89	89	-	3,600,000	40,449	1,800,000	3.3%	3.4%	4.2%
Pittsfield	4	71	64	7	6,544,686	102,261	1,636,172	2.6%	2.5%	7.6%
New Bedford	2	63	54	9	5,000,000	92,593	2,500,000	2.3%	2.1%	5.8%
Taunton	1	28	28	-	2,000,000	71,429	2,000,000	1.0%	1.1%	2.3%
Leominster	1	21	21	-	693,618	33,029	693,618	0.8%	0.8%	0.8%
Springfield	1	11	11	-	630,000	57,273	630,000	0.4%	0.4%	0.7%
Total	48	2,709	2,605	104	86,464,385	33,192	1,801,341	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%

Endnotes

This update and the 2022 MLRI <u>HDIP report</u> was compiled by Judith Liben, housing attorney and Access to Justice Fellow at the <u>Mass. Law Reform Institute (MLRI)</u>. Judith welcomes all corrections, comments, questions, debate and discussion. Her email is jliben@mlri.org.

- Bills filed in this legislative session would increase the cap on HDIP awards to \$100 million annually.
- All approved projects (conditional or final certification) inception to date (2013 forward)
- Projects first approved (conditional certification) FY2021 through December 2024
- 5 GL c. 40V, Section 4 (2020 addition in bold) Annually, on or before the first Wednesday in December, the department shall file a report detailing its findings of the review of all certified housing development projects that it evaluated in the prior fiscal year to the commissioner of revenue, to the joint committee on revenue and the joint committee on housing and community development. The report shall include, but not be limited to: (i) a list of municipalities with approved HD zones; (ii) a list of housing development projects that have received certification; (iii) information about each housing development project, including the site address, project sponsor, range of rents of the residential units, type of residential units, number of each type of residential unit, number of affordable rental units for persons whose income is not more than 60 per cent of the area median income and the number of affordable owner-occupied units for persons whose income is not more than 80 per cent of the area median income; and (iv) the total amount of qualified project expenditures for which a tax credit was issued or reserved pursuant to section 5 for each housing development project, the year the credit was issued and the completion or estimated completion year of the housing development project.
- EOHLC awards credits in two steps. It issues a conditional award certifying that a project is eligible for a certain dollar value of credit if it proceeds as proposed, It issues the final credit award (certification) after construction is complete and at least 80% of the market rate units have been leased or sold. The annual cap on credits applies to final awards.

The MLRI report revealed that HDIP is targeted mostly to small households with disposable income; almost no affordable units; credits not distributed evenly or equitably among Gateway Cities; HDIP rents generally well above market and often shockingly high; mostly small bedroom size units; no direct benefits to lower income families in Gateway Cities.

- The 23 affordable units in the 36 projects covered by the FY2021-24 Chapter 40V reports include 13 units for renters with incomes at or below 60% of area median income (AMI), one condominium for a household at 60% of AMI, and another 9 units for renters with incomes up to 65% of AMI (1) or 80% of AMI (8).
- In the case of completed developments, the "range of rents" shown in the four EOHLC fiscal year reports appear to reflect current asking rents for most.

- A Barnstable HDIP development, for example, projected initial rents of \$1,900 for two-bedroom units when seeking approval of their local tax increment exemption in 2021; it opened in 2023 with initial asking rents of \$3,100-3,400.
- On January 28, as we were finishing this HDIP update, President Trump announced a "pause" on billions of dollars in funding for a wide range of federal grants, loans and programs that assist lower income families including affordable housing programs. Although this freeze was enjoined by several federal courts and repealed on January 29, we expect further attacks on programs supporting vulnerable people, including low-income and immigrant households. State action, including revising HDIP to include housing for lower income families and individuals, is more imperative now than ever before.